

Director City Planning Report No. CP57/18

Subject: Heritage Study of properties in Dudley Street and Brook Street, Coogee
Folder No: F2016/00475
Author: David Ongkili, Coordinator Strategic Planning



Introduction

Council at its Ordinary Council Meeting of 28 August 2018 resolved the following:

“(Matson/Veitch) that:

- a) Council commences a heritage study of the following dwellings in Coogee for the purpose of publicly exhibiting a proposal to amend Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012 to include them as listed heritage items:
 - 37 Dudley Street, Coogee
 - 39 Dudley Street, Coogee
 - 41 Dudley Street, Coogee
 - 144 Brook Street, Coogee
 - 146 Brook Street, Coogee
 - 146A Brook Street, Coogee
 - 148 Brook Street, Coogee
 - 150 Brook Street, Coogee
- b) subsequently, Council, as part of its LEP review, undertake a Heritage Study to determine whether there should be any new heritage items or conservation areas in the LGA.”

The aerial map below illustrates the extent of the properties referred to in the Council resolution:



Figure 1: Aerial photograph of the subject sites (37, 39, 41 Dudley Street and 144, 146, 148, and 150 Brook Street, Coogee)

A heritage assessment of the above listed properties has been prepared by Council's Heritage Planner for the dwellings at Nos. 37, 39 and 41 Dudley Street, and 144, 146A and 146B, 148 and

150 Brook Street. The correct individual addresses of the properties referred to in the Council resolution as “146 and 146a Brook Street” are 146A and 146B Brook Street.

Issues

Community Consultation

Letters were sent by Council to the owners of the subject properties, dated 18 September 2018, in order to advise them of Council's resolution to commence a heritage study of their properties, and to seek their consent to access the subject sites.

Positive responses were received from 37 and 41 Dudley Street, and 144, 146A and 146B and 150 Brook Street. No responses were received from 148 Brook Street and access was denied from the owners of 39 Dudley Street, Coogee.

Site inspections of 144 Brook Street and 41 Dudley Street were carried out on 2 October 2018. Nos. 146A and 146B Brook Street were viewed on 4 October, No.37 Dudley was inspected 17 October 2018 and No 150 Brook Street was viewed on 25 October 2018.

Research and methodology

The heritage study is based on desktop research and investigations and has relied on Council's historical records, publically available information and resources such as the Land Title, Sands Directory, NSW State Library subdivision maps, online maps, real estate photographs (2018), as well as street view observations and site inspections carried out to a number of properties on 2, 4, 17 and 25 October 2018. The heritage study is at Attachment 1.

The information collected is in Table 1, Appendix 1 of the Heritage Study as attached and includes a description of each individual site, its current condition, as well as any known subdivision, development history and photographs, accessed during site visits as well as any publicly available and recent internal images online.

For this heritage study each building has been categorised as being either ‘contributory’, ‘neutral’ or ‘uncharacteristic’ based on the information available and documented. As explained in the table below, a “contributory” rating essentially denotes that the study finds a property to be from the main development period of the investigation, in this case, the Interwar period, and that the property is highly/substantially intact or, if altered, still recognisable and reversible. A property with a “contributory” rating essentially meets a level of significance that would contribute to an area as a heritage item in its own right or as a contributing item in the overall character of a heritage conservation area.

A “neutral” rating means that a property is from the main development period but heavily altered as to be irreversible or from a period outside the main development period but reflects the predominant scale and form of other buildings in a Heritage Conservation Area and does not detract from the character of a Heritage Conservation Area.

A property that is rated as “uncharacteristic” essentially would be from a period outside the main development period and have scale, form and materials that is not consistent with the key characteristics of the Heritage Conservation Area.

Summary of findings

Following investigations and site inspections of the properties listed in Council's resolution, the properties were rated in terms of the three assessment categories in the following summary of findings:

Nos. 37, 39, 41 Dudley Street, Coogee

- No. 37 Dudley Street was modified throughout during the latter part of the twentieth century. Although it retains its original layout within the front portion, along with internal timber joinery and fretwork, the dwelling comprises additions to its rear, upper floor level extension and rendered brick. The heritage study rates the heritage significance of the building as “neutral”.

- No.39 Dudley Street has no development history available in Council's records, however, publicly available internal photographs indicate that the dwelling is substantially intact and will provide a good example of an Inter-War bungalow. While access to the site was unable to be obtained, recent real-estate marketing images (listed April 2018) show that internally the dwelling retains many of the original significant features including timber floors, skirtings, architraves, decorative ceiling detail, decorative timber fretting to hallway arch and living room entrance, leadlight windows to internal French doors features, timber fireplace mantel. It also shows these elements are in very good condition. Images indicate that there were some later fit-out alterations to the kitchen area. Real-estate floor plan images also show that the dwelling has retained a typical floor plan for an early twentieth century bungalow dwelling. Additionally, historical land titles records indicate that the site (Lot B) was one of three lots (A, B and C) formed in 1921 following the formation of lots 12 and 13 of the Edgumbe Estate Subdivision in 1920. The site was originally owned by James Joseph Farrell (May 1921), however by July the same year the property was owned by Elma Joseph Seaton. EJ Seaton appears within the Sands Directory in 1923 as the site's first occupant in 1923. The site was then owned by Earnest Richard Walken until 1966. There is no significant history recorded on the life of early owners or occupants of the site. The heritage study rates the heritage significance of the building as "contributory". In view of this assessment, the property at No. 39 Dudley Street is determined to be significant in terms of the historical, aesthetic and representative criteria of the NSW Heritage Office guidelines for assessing heritage significance and therefore warrants local heritage listing. Historically, the property is associated with a significant historical phase being the Interwar period and expresses this through its association with an identifiable group comprising Nos. 37, 39 and 41 Dudley Street (all likely to have been constructed between 1922 and 1923). With matching Interwar architectural characteristics including double fronted battened gables, consistent landscaped front setbacks, brick construction and timber framed casement bay windows to the front elevation, No 39 Dudley Street exemplifies outstanding continuity in this historical process. Aesthetically, the property shows distinctive aesthetic qualities in its form/composition including the retention of a characteristic floor plan of an early twentieth century Interwar bungalow and exemplifies this particular architectural style outstandingly well. Additionally, being part of a group of sub-divided properties at No 37, 39 and 41 Dudley Street, No. 39 Dudley Street is representative of suburban development in Coogee that was significantly driven by the extension of the tramline to Coogee.
- No. 41 Dudley Street retains many of its original architectural features including timber paneling, joinery, flooring, electrical hardware and fireplaces. Some elements such as paint and plaster along the ceilings and walls are peeling and there is some evidence (internally and externally) of cracking within the brick work. The kitchen area has also been partially modified with the installation of a mid-twentieth century benchtop, however, overall, the dwelling represents a largely unaltered example of an Inter-War bungalow which demonstrates considerable aesthetic value to the Dudley Street streetscape. Additionally, historical land titles records indicate that the site (Lot C) was one of three lots (A, B and C) formed in 1921 following the formation of lots 12 and 13 of the Edgumbe Estate Subdivision in 1920. The site was originally owned by Peter Soulos 1921-1929. The name Peter Soulos first appears in the Sand Directory in 1923. The name appears below 'Edgumbe Street' within the Dudley Street listing (which suggests that the property may have previously had an Edgumbe Street address. By 1928, the same name appears next to the No.41 (still identified as being east of Edgumbe Street). However, by 1932/33 the Sands Directory shows that nos.37, 39 and 41 are all west of Edgumbe Avenue, and that No.41 continued to be. The heritage study rates the heritage significance of the building as "contributory". In view of this assessment, the property at No. 41 Dudley Street is determined to be significant in terms of the historical, aesthetic and representative criteria of the NSW Heritage Office guidelines for assessing heritage significance and therefore warrants local heritage listing. Historically, the property is associated with a significant historical phase being the Interwar period and expresses, through its fabric, exceptional continuity in this historical process as evidence from its largely unaltered presentation as an Inter-War bungalow. Aesthetically, the

property shows distinctive aesthetic qualities through its original architectural features including timber paneling, joinery, flooring, electrical hardware and fireplaces. It exemplifies the Interwar architectural style exceptionally well. Furthermore, given its location in the group of sub-divided properties at Nos 37, 39 and 41 Dudley Street, the property is also representative of suburban development in Coogee that was significantly driven by the extension of the tramline to Coogee.

Nos. 144, 146 and 150 Brook Street, Coogee

- No.144 Brook Street is occupied by two buildings. The first building is a two storey Inter-War residential flat building with frontage to Brook Street comprising four units, originally known as '*Minmi Flats*', constructed between 1915 and 1920. The Sands Directory indicates that the building was known as '*Kelvin Court*' from 1928. While some of the units had been modified in part, the two units at first floor level retained many original features including original internal layout, timber doors, joinery, electrical hardware and flooring (particularly in the primary living spaces). It was also evident that the building's frontage had undergone substantial changes with the infill of the balconies, application of roughcast render and alterations to the entrance stairs. The heritage study rates the heritage significance of the building as "neutral". The second building is a two storey mid-twentieth century duplex located at the rear of the site with frontage to Edgecumbe Avenue and known as 1-3 Edgecumbe Avenue. While access to No 1-3 Edgecumbe Avenue was not obtained, publically available photos show that the dwelling contains minimal original or significant fabric.
- No 146A and 146B comprises two dwelling units in a two storey duplex building known as '*Rosalie Flats*' and first appears within the Sands Directory at No.146 Brook Street in 1930, however Council's records indicate that the flats were completed in 1928. The land was further subdivided in 1954 with the lot fronting Brook Street now known as No. 146 Brook Street, and the lot to the rear known as 5 Edgecumbe Avenue (occupied by a two storey Art Deco residential flat building '*Roberta Flats*'). Site observations and development history indicates the duplex building fronting Brook Street has undergone a number of external changes including the installation of a garage at lower ground level, as well as internal contemporary updating to kitchen and bathrooms. Both dwellings within this duplex building retain a high proportion of significant internal fabric including decorative ceiling detail, joinery and flooring and are in good condition. The heritage study rates the heritage significance of the building as "contributory". Access to units 1 and 2 of No.1 Edgecumbe Avenue was not obtained, however photos of unit 2 are publically available and show that the dwelling contains minimal original or significant fabric.
- No. 148 is a single storey Inter-War bungalow, constructed c.1925 and due to the slope of the land have an elevated frontage to Brook Street. The original occupants first appear within the Sands Directory in 1925 and the dwellings were known as No.150 and No.152 respectively. The dwellings are later identified nos.148 and 152 respectively following renumbering within the street in 1927. Publicly available internal photographs for No.148 Brook Street indicate that the dwelling has retained its original architectural details, internal layout and is in very good condition. Historically, the land formed part of original subdivision sale of Edgecumbe Estate in 1915, the land was further subdivided in 1922 to form two lots (Lots A and B DP305284). No. 148 Brook Street first appears within the Sands Directory in 1928 occupied by A Crawley (Medical Practitioner). A Crawley's name first appears in 1925 as the listed occupant of No.150 Brook Street which suggests that the dwelling was likely to have been built at this time. Lots A and B, DP 305284 were known as 150 and 152 until 1927. House numbers changed along Brook Street after this time and the dwellings became known as No. 148 Brook Street (Lot B) and No. 150 Brook Street (Lot A). Aubrey Joseph Clarence Crawley was a registered Medical Practitioner (1896) and represented Sydney University in the NSW Premier Cricket (formerly known as Electoral Cricket and Sydney Grade Cricket) since its first season in 1893-94. The heritage study rates the heritage significance of the building as "contributory". In view of this assessment, the property at No. 148 Brook Street is determined to be significant in terms of the historical and aesthetic criteria of the NSW Heritage Office guidelines for assessing heritage significance and therefore warrants local heritage listing.

Historically, the property is associated with a significant historical phase being the Interwar period and expresses through its fabric, continuity in this historical process. Aesthetically, the property shows distinctive aesthetic qualities in its form/composition including its original architectural detail and internal layout thus exemplifying the Interwar architectural style exceptionally well.

- No. 150 Brook Street is single storey Inter-War bungalow with sandstone base, painted face brick construction with brick and rendered verandah posts and a terracotta hipped and gabled roof form. The dwelling has undergone a number of alterations and additions including some removal of internal walls, contemporary timber French doors to front verandah, as well as rear kitchen and living area extensions and swimming pool within the rear garden. A number of rooms within the front portion of the dwelling retain their decorative features including plaster ceilings, picture rails and windows and fireplace however it was also evident that parts the newer rear additions incorporated non-original, yet replica historical architectural features such as plaster ceiling detail, wall vents, wide timber skirtings timber window and door frames. The site retains its original building form and many of its significant external features to the front façade. Additionally, historical land records The land formed part of original subdivision sale of Edgecumbe Estate in 1915, and was further subdivided in 1922 to form two lots (Lots A and B DP305284). No. 150 Brook Street first appears within the Sands Directory in 1928 occupied by Chris Soulos and Mrs M. Stewart. Chris Soulos's name first appears in 1925 as the listed occupant of No.152 Brook Street which suggests that the dwelling was likely to have been built at this time. Lots A and B were known as 150 and 150 Brook Street until 1927. House numbers changed along Brook Street in 1927 and by 1928 the dwellings were known as 148 (Lot B) and 150 (Lot A). The heritage study rates the heritage significance of the building as "contributory".

Interim Heritage Order - No. 39 Dudley Street

In the course of undertaking the heritage study, on 5 October 2018, Council became aware from local residents of two Complying Development Certificate applications involving the proposed demolition of the existing dwellings at Nos. 37 and 39 Dudley Streets and construction of single residential dwellings on each property. The heritage study indicated that Nos. 37, 39 and 41 Dudley were likely to have been constructed between 1922 and 1923. The dwellings represent a small group of Inter-War bungalows with similar architectural characteristics including double fronted battened gables, consistent landscaped front setbacks, brick construction and timber framed casement bay windows to the front elevation. Additionally, as indicated in the preceding section, the study found that:

- No. 37 Dudley Street was modified throughout during the latter part of the twentieth century. Although it retains its original layout within the front portion, along with internal timber joinery and fretwork, the dwelling comprises additions to its rear, upper floor level extension and rendered brick. On this basis, the dwelling was assessed as having a "neutral" building contribution rating.
- No. 39 Dudley Street is substantially intact and, on this basis, provides a good example of an Inter-War bungalow. Publically available internal photographs indicate that the dwelling retains a significant proportion of original fabric. The dwelling was assessed as having a "contributory" building contribution rating.

On the basis of this assessment, Council considered that there were significant grounds for requesting the issuing of an Interim Heritage Order on No. 39 Dudley Street given its relatively intact condition as reflected in its "contributory" rating. However, it was considered that there were weaker reasons for requesting a similar order on the dwelling at No. 37 Dudley Street given its compromised condition at the rear and, hence, its "neutral" rating.

On the 8 October 2018, an Interim Heritage Order (IHO) (refer to Attachment 2) was placed on 39 Dudley Street (Lot B DP 301 192). The IHO was published in the Government Gazette on 8 October 2018 and is consistent with the provisions of the Heritage Act 1977 and the Heritage Council Guidelines. In particular, Section 25 of the Heritage Act 1977 authorises a Council to

make an Interim Heritage Order for a building and/or place that Council considers may, on further inquiry or investigation, be found to be of local heritage significance, and that the council considers is being or is likely to be harmed.

After the IHO was gazetted, Council undertook the following actions:

- Notified the affected owner or occupier of the IHO and the notice is to include a statement as to the effect of the order and the reasons for making the order.
- Published in a newspaper circulating in the area in which the building item is situated a notice of the making of the order.
- Informed the NSW Office of Environment and Heritage (OEH) of the IHO so it can be included in the Office's IHO inventory

An IHO lasts for 6 months unless Council resolves to add the item to its LEP schedule, in which case, 12 months applies. Council can also revoke an IHO at any time. Council is also required to make a decision about whether to take further action to list the building/place as a heritage item on a Local Environmental Plan (LEP). This decision must be based on a heritage assessment prepared by a person with appropriate heritage knowledge, skills and experience who can be an employee of, or a consultant expert engaged by Council. In this regard, the subject Heritage Study has been prepared by Council's Heritage Planner and concludes that No. 39 Dudley Street, and another two identified properties (at No 41 Dudley Street and No. 148 Brook Street) warrant heritage listing in the Randwick LEP 2012 Schedule. Furthermore, the Study recommends that all properties studied in the Heritage Study warrant inclusion as part of a Heritage Conservation Area.

It should be noted that on 31 October 2018, the owners of No. 39 Dudley Street filed a Class 1 Application Appeal in the Land and Environment Court against the making of the Interim Heritage Order. The matter is listed for a directions hearing on 28 November 2018.

Relationship to City Plan

The relationship with the City Plan is as follows:

Outcome 7: Heritage that is protected and celebrated.

Direction 7a: Our heritage is recognised, protected and celebrated.

Financial impact statement

There is no direct financial impact for this matter.

Conclusion

Eight properties were investigated as part of the heritage study in line with the Council resolution. Six buildings were identified as having "contributory" value to the Inter-War character of the area and, together with the properties identified as "neutral", are therefore recommended to be incorporated into a heritage conservation area. Additionally, in the group of six "contributory" buildings, three properties at Nos. 39 and 41 Dudley Street and No. 148 Brook Street were identified as of such significance as to warrant local heritage listing.

Recommendation

That:

- a) Council endorse the Heritage Study dated 25 October 2018 which recommends that 37, 39 and 41 Dudley Street and 144, 146A, 146B, 148 and 150 Brook Street Coogee be considered for incorporation into a heritage conservation area, and that 39 and 41 Dudley

Street, and 148 Brook Street, Coogee, be considered for local heritage listing.

- b) Council prepare a Planning Proposal to amend the *Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012* to list and create a Heritage Conservation Area to incorporate 37, 39 and 41 Dudley Street, Coogee and 144, 146A, 146B, 148 and 150 Brook Street Coogee, and to list 39 and 41 Dudley Street, Coogee and 148 Brook Street, Coogee as local heritage items.
- c) Council refer the Planning Proposal to the Randwick Local Planning Panel (RLPP) for advice prior to resolving that it be forwarded for "Gateway Determination".

Attachment/s:

- | | |
|--|-------------------------------|
| 1. Heritage Study of properties on the corner of Brook Street and Dudley Street, Coogee | Included under separate cover |
|--|-------------------------------|